A selective sweep on a deleterious mutation in the CPT1A gene in Arctic populations

Florian J. Clemente1,18, Alexia Cardona1,18,*, Charlotte E. Inchley1, Benjamin M. Peter2, Guy Jacobs3,4, Luca Pagani1, Daniel J. Lawson5, Tiago Antão6, Mário Vicente1, Mario Mitt7, Michael DeGiorgio8, Zuzana Faltyskova1, Yali Xue9, Qasim Ayub9, Michal Szpak9, Reedik Mägi7, Anders Eriksson10,11, Andrea Manica10, Maanasa Raghavan12, Benjamin M. Peter2, Guy Jacobs3,4, Luca Pagani1, Daniel J. Lawson5, Tiago Antão6, Mário Vicente1, Mario Mitt7, Michael DeGiorgio8, Zuzana Faltyskova1, Yali Xue9, Qasim Ayub9, Michal Szpak9, Reedik Mägi7, Anders Eriksson10,11, Andrea Manica10, Maanasa Raghavan12, Benjamin M. Peter2, Guy Jacobs3,4, Luca Pagani1, Daniel J. Lawson5, Tiago Antão6, Mário Vicente1, Mario Mitt7, Michael DeGiorgio8, Zuzana Faltyskova1, Yali Xue9, Qasim Ayub9, Michal Szpak9, Reedik Mägi7, Anders Eriksson10,11, Andrea Manica10, Maanasa Raghavan12, Benjamin M. Peter2, Guy Jacobs3,4, Luca Pagani1, Daniel J. Lawson5, Tiago Antão6, Mário Vicente1, Mario Mitt7, Michael DeGiorgio8, Zuzana Faltyskova1, Yali Xue9, Qasim Ayub9, Michal Szpak9, Reedik Mägi7, Anders Eriksson10,11, Andrea Manica10, Maanasa Raghavan12, Simon Rasmussen13, Eske Willerslev12, Antonio Vidal-Puig9,14, Chris Tyler-Smith9, Richard Vilems7,15,16, Rasmus Nielsen2, Mait Metspalu17, Boris Malyarchuk17, Miroslava Derenko17, Toomas Kivisild1,15,**

1 Department of Archaeology and Anthropology, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, CB2 3QG, United Kingdom
2 Department of Integrative Biology, University of California Berkeley, Berkeley, California, CA 94720-3140, United States of America
3 Mathematical Sciences, University of Southampton, Southampton, SO17 1BJ, United Kingdom
4 Institute for Complex Systems Simulation, University of Southampton, Southampton, SO17 1BJ, United Kingdom
5 Heilbronn Institute, School of Mathematics, University of Bristol, Bristol, BS8 1TH, United Kingdom
6 Department of Vector Biology, Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine, L3 5QA, United Kingdom
7 Department of Evolutionary Biology, Institute of Molecular and Cell Biology, University of Tartu, Tartu, 51010, Estonia
8 Department of Biology, Pennsylvania State University, University Park, Pennsylvania, PA 16802-5301, United States of America
9 Wellcome Trust Sanger Institute, Hinxton, CB10 1SA, United Kingdom
10 Department of Zoology, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, CB2 3EJ, United Kingdom
11 Integrative Systems Biology Laboratory, King Abdullah University of Science and Technology (KAUST), Thuwal, 23955-6900, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia
12 Centre for GeoGenetics, Natural History Museum of Denmark, University of Copenhagen, Copenhagen, 1350, Denmark
13 Center for Biological Sequence Analysis, Department of Systems Biology, Technical University of Denmark, Kgs. Lyngby, DK-2800, Denmark
14 Department of Clinical Biochemistry, University of Cambridge and Institute of Metabolic Sciences, MRC, MDU, Cambridge, CB2 2QR, United Kingdom
15 Estonian Biocentre, Tartu, 510104, Estonia
16 Estonian Academy of Sciences, Tallinn, 10130, Estonia
17 Institute of Biological Problems of the North, Russian Academy of Sciences, Magadan, 685000, Russia
18 These authors contributed equally to this work

Correspondance: *ac812@cam.ac.uk, **tk331@cam.ac.uk*
Abstract

Arctic populations live in an environment characterized by extreme cold and the absence of plant foods for much of the year, and are likely to have undergone genetic adaptations to these environmental conditions in the time they have been living there. Genome-wide selection scans based on genotype data from native Siberians have previously highlighted a 3 Mb region on chromosome 11 containing 79 protein-coding genes as the strongest candidate for positive selection in Northeast Siberians. However, it was not possible to determine which of the genes may be driving the selection signal. Here, using whole-genome high-coverage sequence data, we identify the most likely causative variant as a non-synonymous G to A transition (rs80356779; c.1436C>T, p.Pro479Leu) in CPT1A, a key regulator of mitochondrial long-chain fatty acid oxidation. Remarkably, the derived allele is associated with hypoketotic hypoglycemia and high infant mortality, yet occurs at high frequency in Canadian and Greenland Inuits, and was also found at 68% frequency in our Northeast Siberian sample. We provide evidence for one of the strongest selective sweeps reported in humans, which has driven this variant to high frequency in circum-Arctic populations within the last 6 to 23 thousand years despite associated deleterious consequences, possibly due to the selective advantage it originally provided to either a high fat diet or a cold environment.

Main Text

Siberia, with local temperatures occasionally dropping below -70°C in the winter, and only animal food for much of the year, is one of the most extreme habitats human populations have adapted to since their dispersal out of Africa. A high basal metabolic rate, low levels of serum lipids and high blood pressure are among the characteristics considered to be consequences of adaptation in Siberian populations. In a recent genome-wide SNP genotype study of 200 Siberian individuals, the strongest signals of positive selection detected by haplotype homozygosity and allele differentiation tests mapped to a 3 Mb region.
at Chr11:66-69 Mb in Northeast Siberian populations, containing 79 protein-coding genes. Due to the limited density of markers in the SNP data, it was impossible to pinpoint the causative locus for the selection signal. Here, we sequenced the genomes of 25 unrelated individuals from the Chukchi, Eskimo and Koryak populations (Figure S1) with a mean coverage of >40x using the Complete Genomics platform (Table S1). The raw read data on the whole genome sequences presented in the current study have been deposited to the European Nucleotide Archive under accession code PRJEB7258. The data is also available at the data repository of the Estonian Biocentre. Informed consent was obtained from all human subjects and the study was approved by the Ethics Committee of the Institute of Biological Problems of the North, Russian Academy of Sciences, Magadan, Russia (statement no. 001/011 from 21 January, 2011) and Cambridge Ethics Committee (HBREC.2011.01). We used these sequence data to search for derived variants that are common in Northeast Siberians and rare or absent elsewhere. We then applied sequence diversity, derived allele frequency and haplotype homozygosity-based methods to identify the possible causative variant(s) that are driving the signal, and to estimate their age and strength of selection.

We applied QIAGEN’s Ingenuity® Variant Analysis™ software to 21,105,873 variants detected in 25 Northeast Siberian samples using a series of filtering steps. A total of 14,183,704 variants with call quality and depth higher than 20 were outside 0.2% of the most variable exonic 100 bp regions and outside 1% exonic most variable genes in the 1000 Genomes data7,8. We excluded variants with >1% frequency in public data (including 1000 Genomes data7,8, Complete Genomics public genomes9 and NHLBI ESP exome data) and retained 8,278 variants with >50% carrier frequency in our Northeast Siberian sample. We applied additional filters excluding indel and substitution type variants and retained 148 SNPs
with non-reference allele frequency >50%. Among these 148 SNPs (Table S2) we detected three with a possible functional consequence predicted by their location in exonic, promoter, enhancer region or among phylogenetically conserved positions (phyloP value < 10^{-3}). Note that unrecognized regulatory regions that may be under selection would not be detected by these filters. Among these three mutations two, one non-synonymous (c.1436C>T) mutation in carnitine palmitoyltransferase I \((CPT1A [MIM 600528])\) and another in the promoter region of immunoglobulin mu binding protein 2 \((IGHMBP2 [MIM 600502])\) (position 68670984), mapped to the same chromosomal region, Chr11:68.5-68.7 Mb, which lay within the previous candidate region of positive selection in Siberian populations ¹. To investigate whether one of these mutations could be the target of positive selection, we applied further neutrality tests and explored the genetic variation in this region.

First, we searched genome-wide in the sequence data for candidate regions under selection. We merged the 25 Northeast Siberian genomes with a control panel of 25 European and 11 East Asian publicly available, high-coverage Complete Genomics genomes (Drmanac et al. 2010; Personal Genomes Project) (Table S3). The integrated Haplotype Score (iHS) test ¹⁰ confirmed our previous findings ¹, with the largest number of significant (here, top 1%) windows falling within the Chr11:66-69 Mb region (Figure S2; Table S4). The two top ranking iHS windows mapped within the Chr11:66-69 Mb region, and the window containing \(CPT1A\) ranked 45th among 13,035 genomic windows, while the window containing \(IGHMBP2\) was not significant (Figure 1). In the control populations, neither of these windows was significant.

Second, we performed genome-wide Tajima’s D ¹¹ scans that highlighted two windows with significantly negative D values in the Chr11:66-69 Mb region (Figure 1; Table S5). These
two windows narrowed the 3 Mb selection candidate region to 400 kb (68.2-68.6 Mb), which contains five protein-coding genes: low density lipoprotein receptor-related protein 5 (*LRP5* [MIM 603506]), protein phosphatase 6, regulatory subunit 3 (*PPP6R3* [MIM 610879]), galanin (*GAL* [MIM 137035]), metallothionein-like 5, testis-specific (*MTL5* [MIM 604374]) and *CPT1A*. As with iHS, the window containing *IGHMBP2* was not significant in the Tajima’s D scans. Also, the Tajima’s D statistic in the 400 kb region was not significantly different from the genomic average in the control populations (Figures 1 and S3). Thus, both iHS and Tajima’s D tests provided evidence that the selection signal is restricted to Northeast Siberians, and favored *CPT1A* over *IGHMBP2* as the target of selection.

To corroborate this conclusion, we considered the derived site-frequency spectrum (SFS) in the region surrounding *CPT1A* against the background, allowing us to study deviations from neutrality without the assumption of mutation-drift equilibrium. In Northeast Siberians, the SFS in the 68-69 Mb region shows an excess of low- and high-frequency variants compared to the background SFS of the whole genome, consistent with the expectation under a selective sweep\(^{12,13}\) (see Figure S4). Moreover, we investigated the pattern of linkage disequilibrium (LD) in the 3 Mb region (Chr11:66-69 Mb) and found two distinct LD blocks within the region of 68.2-68.8 Mb, one on each side of the c.1436C>T mutation (Figure S5). Such a pattern is expected in the later stages of a selective sweep when the beneficial allele has reached a frequency >0.5\(^{14,15}\). Therefore, the LD pattern provides further evidence that the c.1436C>T mutation could be driving the signal. However, the c.1436C>T mutation, which is also frequent in other Arctic Inuits, has previously been associated with high infant mortality and hypoketotic hypoglycemia (CPT I deficiency [MIM 255120]) in Canadian Inuits, and its high frequency in these populations has been described as a ‘paradox’ (e.g., Greenberg et al. 2009).
To further explore the global distribution of c.1436C>T, we measured its frequency in a global panel of modern and ancient genomes and created a median-joining network of the locus (Figure 2). In the modern samples, we found c.1436C>T at 68% in the Northeast Siberian populations while being absent in other publicly available genomes. In the ancient samples, the c.1436C>T mutation was absent in both the c. 24 ky (thousand years) old Mal'ta boy and the c. 12.6 ky old Clovis sample, but was heterozygous in the genome of the c. 4 ky old Saqqaq Palaeo-Eskimo. Furthermore, either the c.1436C>T mutation or its associated haplotype were detected in a number of Pre-, Mid- and Late-Dorset ancient DNA samples from Canada and Greenland dating to the last 4 ky with a combined frequency of ~50% (Figure 2a, Table S7). The ancient DNA evidence shows that the c.1436C>T mutation has a minimum age of c. 4 ky, while the ancient and modern samples combined suggest that its spread is restricted to Eskimo-Aleutian and Northeast Siberian populations. The geographic distribution of the haplotype from which the c.1436C>T haplotype is derived was mainly restricted to East Asia (Figure 2a). Notably, in contrast to the recent finding that CPTIA was among the lipid catabolism genes that are enriched for Neanderthal-like sites, the c.1436C>T mutation occurs at the background of 27 other SNPs that are common in Siberians and rare or absent elsewhere. None of these 28 SNPs (Table S7) showed Neanderthal or Denisovan ancestry sharing.

Finally, we used different models to infer population parameters from the data. Our estimates of the effective population size, $N_e$, based on the observed genetic diversity, LD, and MSMC yielded a long-term average $N_e$ of 3000-5000 and supported a constant size model (Figure S6, Table S8). In contrast, a bottleneck scenario, in which the c.1436C>T mutation would have reached high frequencies from standing variation by drift, was not supported.
since the c.1436C>T mutation is absent in other global populations and the derived A-allele in Northeast Siberians occurs within a genomic region of unusually strong LD. Rather, our findings suggest a recent origin of the c.1436C>T mutation in Northeast Siberians.

Under the assumption that the c.1436C>T mutation was the target of positive (directional) selection, we estimated the mode of selection, selection strength (s), and age of the c.1436C>T allele (T_{MRCA}), using an ABC method \(^{24}\). We find strong evidence in favor of selection from a \textit{de novo} mutation \(P(SDN) = 0.98\), as opposed to selection on standing variation. Assuming an additive model of selection, constant population size of \(N_e=3000\), and a generation time of 29 years, we estimated the age of c.1436C>T to be 3 (HPD 1-23) ky with a strong selection coefficient of \(s=0.14\) (HPD 0.02-0.30) (Figure S7). Selection coefficients of such magnitude have rarely been reported in humans before \(^{24}\). To further explore the impact of \(N_e\) on our estimates, we repeated the analysis with \(N_e=5000\) and \(N_e=7000\), yielding qualitatively unchanged results (Table S9). Note, however, that despite the fact that weak selection coefficients can be ruled out by the ABC approach (Figure S7), the method fails to constrain the upper bound of selection strength, limiting the accuracy of the age estimation. It is thus likely that the times are underestimates of the true age of the mutation. A maximum-likelihood estimate (MLE) for the T_{MRCA} for c.1436C>T, assuming a Poisson model and a starlike genealogy resulted in slightly older age estimates, but within the HPD interval of the ABC method. Based on high and low mutation rates \(^{25}\), these T_{MRCA} estimates were 6.7 (CI 3-13) ky and 13.3 (CI 6-26) ky, respectively, for a region of 58,084 bp surrounding c.1436C>T (Table S10). These independent estimates of T_{MRCA} further support strong selection when using the diffusion approximation to the fixation time of a selective sweep \(^{26}\), and are consistent with the presence of the allele in the 4 ky old Saqqaq genome and absence from older genomes. Overall, when combining ancient DNA evidence with the ABC
and ML based estimates and using slower mutation rate, a TMRCA of 6-23 kya seems most plausible.

Our results provide evidence that the c.1436C>T mutation was the likely target of selection, driving the sweep signal over the surrounding genomic region. Together with the high frequency of the variant in the coastal populations in Northeast Siberia, North America and Greenland (Figure 2a; Collins et al. 2010), this finding suggests that the mutation might have historically conveyed a selective advantage to populations in these regions. With agriculture being unsustainable in this part of the world due to its extreme cold environment, these coastal populations mostly fed on marine mammals, consuming a high fat diet rich in n-3 polyenoic fatty acids \(^3,27\). Such a diet would have led the populations to be in a permanent state of ketosis \(^3,28\) where metabolism is mainly “lipocentric” (ketone bodies, fatty acids) rather than “glucocentric” (glucose) as found in a high carbohydrate diet \(^29\). A lipocentric metabolism provides an efficient means of maintaining energy, which is similar to the state experienced during starvation \(^3\).

CPT1A imports long-chain fatty acids into mitochondria for use in fatty acid oxidation. This helps to maintain energy homeostasis and normoglycemia when carbohydrate intake is low \(^4\). The extent to which the c.1436C>T mutation contributes to disorders associated with CPT1 deficiency such as hypoketotic hypoglycemia and sudden infant death syndrome is still unclear. The derived allele has been reported as being deleterious in both the homozygous and heterozygous state. Yet, its phenotypic effect may depend upon many environmental factors, e.g., feeding history, infection and climate \(^3,4\). It is known that the mutation decreases fatty acid oxidation and ketogenesis, explaining its role in hypoketotic hypoglycemia \(^3,27\). However, there is also evidence that the mutation decreases the inhibitory effect of malonyl-
CoA on fatty acid β-oxidation in mitochondria, thereby partially compensating for the drop in ketogenesis associated with the reduced CPT1A enzyme activity \(^3\,^{,27}\). A study on Alaskan Yup’iks also suggests that the c.1436C>T mutation may exert a cardio-protective role through its association with elevated HDL-cholesterol levels and reduced adiposity \(^27\). Moreover, the large amounts of n-3 polyenoic fatty acids in the traditional diet of these aboriginal peoples are known to increase the activity of CPT1A \(^3\,^{,27}\). In this context, the CPT1A activity decrease due to the c.1436C>T mutation could be protective against over-production of ketone bodies \(^3\). These important metabolic effects of CPT1A provide the basis of our hypothesis that the c.1436C>T mutation may have conferred a metabolic advantage for the Northeast Siberian populations in dealing with their traditional high fat diet. The deleterious effect of the mutation might be explained by a change from the traditional diet to a more carbohydrate-based one or by recent cultural shifts and environmental stressors such as fasting and pathogens.

In conclusion, CPT1A c.1436C>T joins the short list of known human variants where ill-health in present-day populations is a likely consequence of the same variant being selectively advantageous in the past. Compared with the sickle cell allele rs334 (sickle cell disease [MIM 603903]/malaria resistance [MIM 611162]) \(^30\) or rs73885319, rs60910145 and rs71785313 in apolipoprotein L-I (APOL1 [MIM 603743]) (kidney disease (FSGS4 [MIM 612551])/sleeping sickness resistance)\(^31\), the c.1436C>T allele shares the property of altering a protein sequence. However, it does not represent an example of heterozygous advantage like the sickle cell allele, instead providing an advantageous or disadvantageous effect dependent on the environment. In this way, it extends the range of selective forces contributing to current ill-health beyond infectious diseases. It illustrates the medical
relevance of an evolutionary understanding of our past and suggests that evolutionary impacts on health might be more prevalent than currently appreciated.

Web Resources

The URLs for data presented herein are as follows:
- European Nucleotide Archive study data, http://www.ebi.ac.uk/ena/data/view/PRJEB7258
- iHS analysis, http://hgdp.uchicago.edu
- Ingenuity Variant Analysis, https://variants.ingenuity.com/va/
- Ingenuity Variant Analysis filtering steps, https://variants.ingenuity.com/Arctic
- Personal Genomes Project, https://my.pgp-hms.org/public_genetic_data

References


**Figure Legends**

**Figure 1:** Localization of positive selection signals within a 3 Mb region on Chromosome 11 (66-69 Mb).

(A) High concentration of significant iHS (upper panel) and Tajima's D (lower panel) signals are found in a 3 Mb region (Chr 11: 66-69 Mb) in Northeast Siberians. The results are shown in the context of the East Asian and European control populations. Pale grey lines highlight the boundaries of each 200 kb window in the region. The horizontal black dotted line marks the threshold of 1% significance. The overlapping 400 kb region (Chr11:68.2-68.6 Mb) of significant results from both tests is highlighted by a bold black rectangle. (B) The genome-wide selection scans show that the window containing *CPT1A* (Chr 11:68.4-68.6 Mb) highlighted by the red dot in the three plots is significant in the Northeast Siberian populations but not in the control populations (Europeans and East Asians). The black dots are the significant data points in both iHS and Tajima’s D. Dotted lines show the significance thresholds of the respective tests.

**Figure 2:** Geographic distribution and network of the *CPT1A* c.1436C>T mutation and its associated haplotype.

(A) The c.1436C>T derived allele is defined by the rs80356779 G to A mutation and occurs with a frequency of 0.9, 0.875 and 0.5625 in Chukchi, Eskimo, and Koryaks, respectively, while is absent elsewhere (1000 Genomes Project\(^7,8\), CG public data\(^9\) and Personal Genomes Project). We used three SNPs (rs10896365 A to G, rs80356779 G to A and rs3794020 T to C) to define the haplotype GAT (red, see panel B). The haplotype ancestral to the c.1436C>T mutation (GGT) is shown in black. The white node represents all other haplotypes. Grey shading that encompasses both the white and black nodes refers to cases where information only for rs80356779 was available. The map shows the geographic distribution of these haplotypes. Haplotype data were drawn from modern (blue font) and ancient DNA (red font) sources, including: CEK – Chukchi, Eskimo, Koryaks (present study); 1000 Genomes Project\(^7,8\), NUN – Nunavut Inuit \(^3\); M'TA – Mal’ta \(^16\); ANZ – Clovis \(^17\); ALE – Aleutian Islander, DOR – Early- Middle- and Late Dorset (Table S10) \(^19\); SQQ – Saqqaq \(^18\); and GIN – Greenland Inuit \(^2\). (B) The Haplotype Median Joining Network was constructed from sequences of the Northeast Siberians, and control populations (Europeans
and East Asians) based on 848 SNPs present in the 58,084 bp region (Table S6) surrounding c.1436C>T, using the Network 4.612 package. The circles are proportional to the frequency of the shared haplotype. Based on this network analysis, we chose two SNPs (rs10896365 A to G and rs3794020 T to C) that defined the haplotype (black nodes) ancestral to the c.1436C>T mutation (red nodes). For visualization, some branches in the figure were shortened (marked with break). The dashed lines represent likely recombination events.

Acknowledgements

This research was supported by ERC Starting Investigator grant (FP7 - 261213) to T.K. http://erc.europa.eu/. CTS, YX, QA and MS were supported by the Wellcome Trust (098051). TA was supported by The Wellcome Trust (WT100066MA). M.M and R.V. were supported by EU ERDF Centre of Excellence in Genomics to EBC; T.K, M.M and R.V. by Estonian Institutional Research grant (IUT24-1), and M.M by Estonian Science Foundation (grant 8973).