Pastoral Visitations as Spaces of Negotiation in Andean Indigenous Parishes.

Gabriela Ramos*
University of Cambridge

In the Andes, the pastoral visitation of Indian parishes usually evokes the idea of a strongly oppositional relationship between the Church and local society. This vision, often lacking in nuance, has been widely disseminated both within and outside the academy. Although it derives from a serious academic interest in discovering and analyzing the common thread of the Church’s evangelization policy in Peru¹, this stance, centered on the problem of the “extirpation of idolatry,” has been progressively emptied of content and today tends to serve as the standard means of filling gaps in the understanding of the history of Andean peoples during the colonial period.

The tendency to present the Church in a repressive role only, and Andeans exclusively in the role of passive objects or at best, propelled by automatic mechanisms of resistance, has caused us to lose sight of the task of understanding what the pastoral visitation (visita pastoral) represented as a fundamental means by which the Church interacted with the clergy and their parishioners. Thus the important place of negotiation in the prolonged and complex bond that the Andean peoples maintained with different levels of the Catholic Church has been ignored. Moreover, this tendency has obscured the influence of this interaction on the formation of colonial political culture and its agents, the features of which we need to identify and understand.

This study is based on the examination of a significant portion of the records of ecclesiastical pastoral visitations in the Archiepiscopal Archive of Lima dating from the first seventy years of the seventeenth century. These documents correspond to what

* I would like to thank the anonymous referees for their suggestions. Anne Pushkal translated this article from Spanish.
was at the time an extensive diocese. Since over time new ecclesiastical jurisdictions were created, the boundaries of the present-day diocese no longer correspond to those of the colonial archive.

The pastoral visitations utilized in this study were produced during the tenures of the archbishops Bartolomé Lobo Guerrero (1607-1622), Hernando Arias de Ugarte (1630-1638) and Pedro de Villagómez (1640-1671). In the series of documents that I study, the brief incumbency of Archbishop Gonzalo de Ocampo (1623-1626) has left practically no trace. As other scholars have shown, each of these archbishops had his particular way of conceiving of the relationship between the Church and the indigenous majority of parishioners. Throughout the seventeenth century this relationship was characterized by marked contrasts in the actions and policies of the archbishops. For example, Lobo Guerrero and Villagómez were characterized by their investigatory and repressive fervor, whereas Hernando Arias de Ugarte showed little interest in creating or exacerbating conflicts.

In order to show the degree to which the behavior of the Church in the Andes corresponded to the objectives and strategies established for the entire Catholic world, I will first address the significance of the pastoral visitation after the Council of Trent, and I will show the form in which this mechanism of surveillance and government was adapted to the Andean context. A comparison of the questionnaires and examinations that were employed in various doctrinas (Indian parishes) during the seventeenth century will serve to examine the similarities and differences to be observed between the visitations made in the Andes and those made in other parts. It will be shown that the practices of surveillance, correction, and repression were an integral part of visitations and were not actions expressly created to deal with the specific cultural conditions of the Andean peoples. The application of these measures had a double effect since, as much as the Church sought to uproot or correct practices that it judged erroneous or at all blameworthy and to dismantle the foundations that sustained them,
it also created procedures, relationships, and forms of understanding the world whose range, although wrapped in the veil of the religious, usually extended beyond it. Thus, in the second place, I will examine what sort of atmosphere, what reactions the pastoral visitation produced among parishioners and what effects it had on the formation of local political culture. I suggest that by means of their structure, pastoral visitations could have favored the opening of spaces and forms of negotiation between the communities and their priests, even to the highest levels of the Church. Finally, and to illustrate this last point, I will use case studies to demonstrate how pastoral visitations had an effect upon various processes of political conflict and accommodation, just as it did on the construction of authority in the Indian parishes.

1. Pastoral visitations, Catholic reform, and the missions.

As various students of the Catholic Reformation have noted, the pastoral visit is a foundation of the policies prompted by the Council of Trent. Its objective was to oversee the correct teaching and practice of doctrine, reform customs, inspire or renew religious fervor, reaffirm the authority of the Church’s ministers, and restore balance to the relationship between parish priest and parishioners.\(^3\)

The objectives of the pastoral visitations appear clearly described in the decrees of the Council of Trent in its Twenty-Fourth Session.\(^4\) As a disciplinary method and vehicle by which the Bishops exercised their authority, pastoral visitations did not represent an entirely new practice,\(^5\) even if before Trent one does not detect a similar concern on the part of the Church to carry them out in such a methodical and extensive way. The Tridentine pastoral visitation encouraged uniformity within the Church as possibly never before in its history. The objective of regularizing mechanisms of government, individual conduct, and doctrinal knowledge, and of overseeing the conduct and training of the clergy was attempted at the same time in Europe and in the Americas. The intensity and reach of the visitations varied from diocese to diocese and depended on
the will and means of the bishops, whose authority was considerably reinforced by them.

A crucial aspect of pastoral visitations, of which we historians of colonial Latin America have not taken sufficient note, is that this intervention by the Church represented an innovation not only in the Andes or in Mexico, but also in many European dioceses.⁶

The decrees issued by the bishops who met in the Council sought to clarify doctrinal matters which arose due to the controversy with the Protestants; to create ways of encouraging the religious education of parishioners; and to promote the appropriate training of clergy.⁷ Without question, the Church had before it a task of massive proportions. And to identify places where in the Church’s eyes it was urgent that this be carried out, there was no need for those conducting the visitations to seek out remote locations. For example, in her study of pastoral visitations to the Diocese of Trent in the years after the Council, Cecilia Nubola notes that within this jurisdiction, there existed no tradition of regularly conducted pastoral visitations for which the diocesan ordinary was responsible.⁸ The resistance of the local clergy to the bishops’ inspections and the scant preparation or frank ineptitude for the position that many parish priests displayed were evident within the very diocese that had hosted the sessions of the Council.⁹

In a recent synthesis of the significance of the Tridentine decrees, Robert Bireley has noted that the expansion of missionary activity in Asia and the Americas did not receive serious attention from the Council.¹⁰ This omission could be interpreted as a lack of interest in regions and peoples that were too distant, but it is also possible to contend that, given the intention of the Council to provide direction to the Catholic world in its entirety, it did not need to concern itself with any region in particular.¹¹ It was the task of the provincial and diocesan synods to adapt the decrees of Trent to local situations. ¹² This is exactly what was done in Europe and in Spanish America.
The similarity maintained by the decrees of the Councils held in Lima, especially the Third (1581-1583), to those of Trent is not surprising. The work of the bishops and their advisors who met in Lima consisted precisely in adapting the decrees to local conditions, a task that was continued in the synods held in the years that followed, which we will examine below. The implementation of the decrees went well beyond the ecclesiastical ambit: suffice it to recall that Philip II was one of the European monarchs who received them as laws of the State shortly after the Council sessions concluded. The study and meticulous comparison of the conciliar decrees and, especially, of the doctrinal materials published by the Third Council with those produced by other dioceses can help us to better understand not only the universal dimension of the organization of the Church in the Andes, but also the work of adaptation that was effected.

The examination of pastoral visitations allows the historian to enquire beyond formal texts and to analyze the application of their directives and their intertwinement with concrete aspects of the life of the Indian parishes. Although the information gathered by the visitors (visitadores) is often uneven, one can infer from the inspection reports some aspects of local policy that have been affected by this interaction with the activity of the Church’s representatives.

I have organized and compared the questionnaires from pastoral visitations to Indian parishes belonging to the Diocese of Lima that took place in 1619, 1642, 1648 and 1667. To these I have added the documents that guided the pastoral visitations sent out by the Third Council of Lima (1583). Checking the questions against the objectives proposed in the documents of the Council of Trent confirms the intimate dependency that the texts maintain among themselves. The adaptations to local conditions are slight, but important. These pertain especially to the knowledge of indigenous languages that parish priests were required to demonstrate.
The questionnaires reflect the concerns of the Catholic Church as a universal institution. One can deduce upon first examination that the Andean parishioners were not treated in any special way. The questions used during the pastoral visitation interviews were the same as those that would have been asked of, for example, a Spanish peasant, and likewise, they implied that Andeans were expected to fulfill the same precepts that were required of parishioners in any rural village of Catholic Europe. 19

The topics covered by the questionnaires can be grouped as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priest</th>
<th>Parishioners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Correct administration of the sacraments</td>
<td>Whether there is evidence of heresy, fortune-telling, witchcraft.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Whether there are bonesetters and curers of the evil eye.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whether preaching is regular and if the common language is known</td>
<td>Whether there are visionaries or others who claim a special relationship to the sacred.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duties of his ministry</td>
<td>Cases of violence against the parish priest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whether he commits abuses, whether he charges excessive fees</td>
<td>Married persons not living a married life, cohabitation, incest.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal conduct</td>
<td>Negligence in the fulfillment of wills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administration</td>
<td>Failure to receive the sacraments and failure to attend Mass</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To evaluate the performance of the parish priest, the episcopal inspector’s objective was to confirm that the priest administered the sacraments correctly and – as much as possible – to everyone, and that he not charge the parishioners for doing so. Also, the inspector sought to verify that the priest kept parish registers wherein baptisms, marriages, and burials were properly recorded. These were essential requirements as much within the context of conversion as in that of the education of the Christian parishioners and the construction and consolidation of episcopal jurisdiction. Sacraments like baptism or matrimony were indicators not only of the degree to which the people of the parish were incorporated into the bosom of the Church but also how, in consequence, they conformed to the modifications to the organization of kinship that the Church was attempting to instill. These modifications had significant consequences for society. For example, to create and disseminate the concept of illegitimacy and to prohibit polygamy (thereby limiting the numbers of offspring, especially those of local authorities) was to create obstacles to or modify the mechanisms of succession and inheritance.20

One of the inspectors’ constant demands was that the priests conduct censuses of confesados (those who had made their confession). The creation of these registers was essential if the bishop or his representative were to accomplish the objective of overseeing the progress of evangelization. Confession was a powerful means not only of revealing errors of conduct and thought that had to be corrected and punished, but also of ensuring that the population would submit to the authority of the priest, and through him, to the Church. The census of confesados helped to control the movements of the parishioners of the Indian parishes, albeit within certain limits.21

The bishop’s envoy had to ascertain whether the parish priest preached to his congregation regularly – preferably in indigenous languages – and whether he said mass and undertook the instruction of his parishioners on the appointed days. After the Council of Trent, the Church asked that parish priests be personally involved in
preaching to the faithful, instead of allowing it to be done by itinerant or invited friars who, because of their superior theological and (often) linguistic training, customarily educated the population by means of the sermon. This objective was not easy to attain, hence the concern with establishing seminaries for the preparation of the clergy, and in the New World, the demand that the pastors of Indian parishes know the language of their parishioners.

To all of this was added the inspection of the state of the church itself, its decoration, and its cemetery, and the verification that the rituals of the Mass and the sacraments were being conducted correctly and that the priest periodically visited the annexes of the parish. The interest in the material aspect of the Indian parish bore an importance that went further than the increase in or deterioration of Church patrimony. The state of the church and its ornaments was an indication of the correctness, propriety or “decency” of worship in general, and of the parish’s standing in particular, as we shall see later.

Under the heading of “personal conduct” were grouped the inquiries into whether the priest received guests for extended periods, whether he lived alone or with others, if he gambled, and, although not in every case, whether he displayed a suitable personal appearance.

Under the category of “gobierno” (administration) we note a single but interesting question asking whether the priest received the royal magistrate (corregidor) into the town – or allowed the parishioners to – with the ringing of the church bells. This last reflects, on a small scale, a concern that representatives of the Church take pains to publicly demonstrate what could seem like a disproportionate deference toward the representatives of temporal power, the subject of recurrent political debate and a frequent source of tension. This situation was constant, which calls attention to the fact that the question hardly ever appeared in the questionnaires, possibly because it dealt
with a complicated topic that no one had any intention of resolving: it was evident that it was necessary only to administer it.

Regarding the scrutiny of the Indian parishioners, one notes important contrasts. In the first place, comparing the earliest available questionnaires, both dated 1619,\textsuperscript{23} we note that there were practically no questions about their conduct. This corresponds to what we read in the Synodal Constitutions of 1613 and 1636. In the first, the majority of the sections pertaining to pastoral visitations prioritized examining the comportment of the priest. Following the recommendations of previous texts, the Synodal Constitutions in general advised a friendly, persuasive, and paternal attitude toward parishioners. The use of force was advised only if the former had been exhausted.\textsuperscript{24} Only one of the sections addressed the subjects of cohabitation, drunkenness, and \textit{guacas} (sacred places or shrines), and called for the application of “great vigilance and punishment,” advising that the procedures drawn up in the Second Council of Lima (1567) be followed.\textsuperscript{25}

The questionnaires corresponding to the term of the Archbishop Pedro de Villagómez (1642), contained a series of questions that, although not completely new, left no stone unturned in their scrutiny of parishioners’ lives and conduct. According to these questions, the inspector had to ascertain, for example, whether there were any Indians who had shown signs of heresy or had “sown errors;” whether any had committed public sins and caused scandal; if any believed in omens, “libros de suertes” [books of fortune-telling or divination?] or “enchanters;” if they had failed to receive the sacraments or had neglected to baptize children or bury the dead in consecrated places.\textsuperscript{26} It would appear from the questions’ level of detail that, with these questionnaires, Villagómez was introducing some new element to the inquiries to which the indigenous parishes would be submitted. Nevertheless, what we are seeing was common practice in the Church: rather than innovate, return the original source. In
effect, when we compare the questionnaire of 1642 to the General Edict of the Third Council (1583), we can observe that the questions are virtually the same.27

A brief comparison of what was investigated in the pastoral visitations in the Diocese of Lima with what appears in the questionnaires, edicts, and proceedings of pastoral visitations in Spain and other parts of Catholic Europe during the seventeenth century shows great similarity in the procedures followed and the questions asked.28 Comparing the themes of questions from pastoral visitations in the Lima diocese to the themes investigated during the course of visitations in Seville, the Portuguese Algarve, Trent, and the Diocese of Paris suggests that the scope of what was examined by the bishops or their representatives in the Andean parishes was very similar, if somewhat reduced with regard to personnel and institutions. For example, whereas in Sevillian parishes the examination of musicians, teachers and chaplaincies (capellanías) was considered, in the Andean Indian parishes these figures were not mentioned in the questionnaires. The inquiries in the Andes revolved mainly around the figure of the parish priest.

Unlike European pastoral visitations, the ordinary visitations in the Diocese of Lima make no mention of health specialists. While the visitations to the Diocese of Seville and Paris included, for example, questions and observations about the performance of doctors and midwives,29 in the documents from Lima these inquiries are practically indiscernible. Although questions on this subject appear in the instructions to the bishops’ envoys and in the examinations themselves, medical specialists and themes of health as well as what were considered religious errors typically appear in idolatry visitations, where a significant number of proceedings investigated persons who had been accused and prosecuted as sorcerers and curanderos (healers).30

Thus far, we have given a general view of the nature of pastoral visitations. It can be said that both – the regular visitations and those investigating idolatry – pursued the same end, though the emphasis varied significantly. An examination of the papers
extant in the Archiepiscopal Archive of Lima catalogued under the heading of “Visitas pastorales” suggests that the first category tend toward the examination of priests. They give the impression of having been proceedings through which Church evaluated its own performance. In second case, among the documents that deserve greater attention from researchers, the weight of the investigations falls completely upon the parishioners.\textsuperscript{31} Below, we will see how the inhabitants of the Indian parishes understood and handled the objectives of pastoral visitations.

2. Pastoral visitations and the affirmation of Church authority

The bishop or his inspector [visitador] were charged with ensuring that they conducted the visitation “with love and much virtue and if not, by fear and the exemplary punishment of transgressors.”\textsuperscript{32} This meant that the inspector had to make use of a variety of means to execute his task. The instructions were an invitation to steer clear of extremes, and in general the bishops’ envoys avoided any measures that could have destabilized the Indian parishes. More than a few visitors were genuinely interested in gaining an understanding of local circumstances and, although they lent an ear to the complaints of and denunciations by the indigenous parishioners, in the end they affirmed the priests’ authority, even when they detected slight irregularities or grave failings.

The pastoral visitations made ample and astute use of ritual. The occasion required an atmosphere that reaffirmed the legitimacy of the Christian faith and the authority of its symbols and ministers, thus arousing emotion in the participants to create a favorable reception of the message conveyed by the bishop or his representative. For this reason, the arrival of the ecclesiastical envoy could not be unexpected. The envoy was well aware of what equipment he had to bring, and the attire suitable for the different phases of the visitation. He understood that procedural details had to be observed meticulously.\textsuperscript{33} His instructions specified the hour at which he must make his entrance
into the town, and the prayers, Masses, songs, and gestures that he himself, along with his entourage, the priest, and the faithful, had to perform. The inspector had to know that masterful timing was crucial throughout the visitation, and adjust his actions accordingly. The visitation included the inspection of the church building and its ornament and ritual equipment, the visit to the cemetery accompanied by prayers for the dead, the inspection of the baptismal font, the holy oils, and the tabernacle, the review of the parish registers, and also, the examination of the priest regarding his preparation, credentials, readings, sermons, and his command of his parishioners’ language. During the hours and days that followed, the bishop’s emissary and his retinue gathered information about everything that went on in the parish district, and, as various documents that have come down to us suggest, they adapted the questioning of the local authorities and other members of the parish in accordance with the findings of the assembled facts and testimonies.

It was in this climate that the Church affirmed its authority. Through their leaders and other persons called to testify, the parishioners presented their grievances and accusations and responded to the standard questionnaire. Thus appeared complaints along the lines of which we are already familiar, such as the violent behavior of parish priests, the business interests in which some of them were involved, the fees charged for the administration of the sacraments, and the arbitrary and excessive collection of alms.\textsuperscript{34} It was no small thing for such matters to be aired, even if the responses to them were inconsistent. Through these exchanges, conflicts in the indigenous parish could be eased, or perhaps made more complicated; we at least have enough evidence to assume that the pastoral visitation opened a space in which a number of situations that were brought about during the process of evangelization could be contested. And in the course of these discussions, procedures and ideas about what was and was not just and correct were learned and disseminated. Did the parish priest preach on the days he was obligated to do so? Did he personally baptize children or did he send others to
perform this duty? Was he capable of confessing his parishioners in their own language?
Where, in what form, and under what pretexts did he collect alms and offerings?

To a greater or lesser extent, the pastoral visitation played a significant part in the formation of Indian parishes as sociopolitical units. In other words, what the Church required from Indian parishes and Indian parishioners had a crucial effect in shaping their political culture. A theme little-studied in Andean historiography but explored more in the history of colonial Mexico is that of conflict among rural villages over the head towns (cabeceras) and annexes of the indigenous parishes. The inhabitants of the parochial jurisdictions participated actively in this issue in which the sphere of the sacred played a fundamental role. Contrary to the frequently-suggested interpretation, this type of intervention on the part of the indigenous population was in no way a simple tool used to manage secondary interests. The inquiry into the correct administration of the sacraments opened a door through which the matter was debated in some indigenous parishes and through which those involved could form their arguments and have them heard. To analyze this subject I will make use of documents from the pastoral visitation of a parish in the highlands of the Diocese of Lima from the mid-seventeenth century.

3. Visitations, processes of political accommodation, and the place of the sacred.

In May 1648, during a pastoral visitation to the indigenous parish of San José del Chorillo the licentiate Francisco Calvo de la Cámara inspected the church’s tabernacle and found it open and unlocked. He noted that although a silver monstrance was within, this was empty. The licentiate Martín de Mena Godoy, pastor of the parish, gave as the immediate explanation that the tabernacle key had been lost. The disturbance this fact produced in the visitor, his retinue, and all those present must have been profound given that a focal point of the ritual of the church visitation was the moment in which the envoy, having examined the tabernacle, displayed the Blessed Sacrament to be
adored by those assembled. In the days that followed, the licentiate Calvo de la Cámara investigated, among other things, whether the Eucharist was present in the churches of the ecclesiastical district. Eighteen people – all adult males – were called to testify. As was customary, the group was predominantly made up of authorities, including caciques, governors, headmen, camachicos, and mayors. In the questionnaire that the inspector drew up, the question concerning the matter read:

...whether they know that in no town of this benefice nor in this [town] of San Joseph del Chorrillo where said licentiate Martin de Mena Godoy is assigned has not had, nor has the Blessed Sacrament of the Eucharist for the consolation and edification and admirable protection of the Indians and [whether] for this [purpose] it would be offered by night or by day at the time[s] when Mass could not be said nor hosts consecrated for giving the Viaticum and assisting with the needs of the sick having as [they] have tabernacles and monstrance where it can be kept with great decency, [that] they say what they have seen and know.

Given that we know that among the first questions to be asked about the performance of the parish priest were those that sought to determine whether he fulfilled the administration of the sacraments, it is imperative to ask why the licentiate Mena Godoy apparently had not addressed a matter so critical to the fulfillment of his responsibilities. The statements of the caciques, headmen and other authorities of the parish, make it evident that they were very well informed about what this was about and what its importance was. The issue of the absence of the Host was intertwined with other aspects of the life of their communities and, according to the statement of the priest, the explanation of such an alarming lack was found in the complicated weave of the fabric that united them.

The town of San José del Chorrillo belonged to the district of Huarochirí, a rich province in the highlands of Lima that provided workers and foodstuffs to the capital of the
viceroyalty and its surrounding areas. Because of its proximity to Lima, Huarochirí was often visited by civil and ecclesiastical authorities. Several Jesuit missions were periodically charged with the indoctrination of the population and, especially in the seventeenth century, more than a few of their inhabitants were reprimanded and even punished for their apparently scant adherence to orthodoxy.  

In the years that followed the arrival of the Spanish, the population of the province underwent profound changes that affected its numbers and the location of several of their principal settlements. In 1586, the corregidor (magistrate) of Huarochirí, Diego Dávila Briceño, asserted in the Relación he wrote about the province that, in the thirteen years he had held the post, he had reduced a population that previously had been dispersed in over two hundred towns into just thirty-nine. Even if the magistrate had exaggerated the number of towns that had existed before he had been charged with creating the reductions, several indicators suggest that in Huarochirí they had produced significant displacements that resulted in the relocation of coastal and highland populations that had not previously shared the same territory. Some of these changes were effected to facilitate the trade between Lima, the central highlands, and Cuzco. In San José, as in the neighboring town of Sisicaya, there had been tambos or places for the rest and provisioning of travelers. The reorganization of territory that the magistrate carried out also had as its objective the separation of the local population from its sacred places and the destruction of the resources that had been allocated for their cult.  

We do not know if San José del Chorrillo had been founded upon an old pre-Hispanic settlement, as was the case for its neighbor Sisicaya, or whether its population was composed of groups from other places. One possible indication that the changes Dávila Briceño claimed to have introduced would have been drastic is that this town, although it was assigned the rank of head town of the indigenous parish, did not have an indigenous name, as was usually the case for the majority of towns in Peru. The ecclesiastical visitation of 1648 reveals that, sixty years after Dávila Briceño wrote his Relación, the order that he had resolved to impose had
changed. This situation and its consequences were manifested in divergent perceptions of the place of the sacred and of the state of the religious indoctrination of the population, as well as in the hierarchy of the towns of the Indian parish.

The statements that the ecclesiastical inspector gathered suggest that the Host was absent from the churches of at least seven of the eight towns of the parish. Some witnesses, like Don García Lласayauri, governor of Sisicaya, claimed that it was not present in any of the churches in the parish district. Juan Bautista, from the town of Santiago de Conchauayca de Guamansica and Don Juan Chauca Guaman, headman and mayor of San Cristóbal de Chatacancha, said that in the churches of their respective towns, there was not even a tabernacle. Other witnesses, like Sebastián Fabián, from the town of San Francisco de Callaguaya, asserted that they knew that the Sacrament was not in their town’s church and that no one had ever seen it. Don Juan Bautista Vilca Caxa, from the town of San Joseph del Chorrillo, said that he had only seen the Sacrament during Corpus Christi and Easter processions. Don Lorenzo Canchu Manco, mayor of San José del Chorrillo, affirmed that in spite of having collected donations for the wax and oil needed to light the sanctuary lamp, there was no Host. Juan Quispi Yalli, camachico of the town of Sisicaya, said that he had gone into the church in the town of San José del Chorrillo to pray and was sure that he had been in its presence, but he was not able to confirm that he had seen it. Everyone concurred in saying that there would be “great consolation and happiness” if the Blessed Sacrament were present in every church of the towns belonging to the parish district.

As he was questioned by the bishop’s envoy, Mena Godoy revealed an important aspect of the then-existing political conditions in the Indian parish under his care. He explained that in his parish district there were only two towns, one the head town that had resulted from the reducción (San José del Chorrillo) and the other, called Santo Domingo de los Olleros, whose origin he did not explain. The rest were ayllos (kinship groups) that had formed towns from ranches (estancias) or from settlements created by people
who had fled the *mitas* (forced labor) and other unfortunate or oppressive circumstances. They were small, poor villages whose residents had built makeshift churches where Mass could not comfortably be said. The two principal towns were in conflict with the newcomers whose existence they tried not to recognize. In Mena Godoy’s words, the principal towns wanted the parvvenu towns to be reduced into themselves. The most powerful, it seems, had obtained government provisions in their favor, but the pastoral visitation’s findings made it clear that they had not achieved their objective.\textsuperscript{54}

The situation that the priest of San José del Chorrillo described shows the degree to which the circumstances of the reductions to which Dávila Briceño had proudly pointed at the end of the sixteenth century had changed. This alteration was due to the actions of the local population, a portion of whom had returned to their old settlements or had formed others in order to have access to the means needed to obtain their livelihood more easily, or to be able to manage their resources more conveniently.\textsuperscript{55} But it must be noted that these changes took place with the knowledge and consent of the Church that, at the moment that the pastoral visitation arose, endorsed them with its ritual activity. Santo Domingo de los Olleros, which Mena Godoy represented as one of the two head towns of his Indian parish, had figured neither in the *Relación* nor in Dávila Briceño’s map. As other researchers have observed, this town could possibly have been founded at the beginning of the seventeenth century.\textsuperscript{56}

According to the statements that the ecclesiastical visitor gathered, the feast of Corpus Christi was celebrated by turns, one year in San José del Chorrillo and the other in Santo Domingo de los Olleros.\textsuperscript{57} The witnesses who said they had seen the Blessed Sacrament were sure they had done so in the churches of those towns.\textsuperscript{58}

Clearly the presence of the Sacrament could give a legitimate character to the church of a village whose residents aspired to have their own authorities, retain a significant margin of independence, and possess a church that would enjoy ritual privileges similar
to those of its neighbors. Over the course of sixty years the inhabitants of one of the towns of the province of Huarochirí had attained this by various means, not all of which are known to us, but we can affirm that one of them was by negotiating with parish priests and episcopal envoys whose intervention and recognition they sought, and succeeded in obtaining.

**Conclusion**

The pastoral visitation opened a space in which to air matters crucial to the political formation of colonial Andean society, since as it investigated whether the parish priest had performed his duties, inspected the equipment and ornament of the churches, and probed the rootedness of the population in its settlements, it was taking the pulse of a scene that was undergoing transformations whose dimensions demand historians’ attention. For this we need to go beyond the terms that have until now predominated in the historiography, which have privileged the repressive aspects of exchanges between the Church and the Andean people that were typical of the idolatry visitation. This perspective has neglected to consider the consequences that pastoral visitations had in shaping the political culture of these same populations. As we have tried to show here by means of a case study, the dispute over the location of the sacred in its highest Christian expression played fundamental role when it came to defining the dominance of some villages – and kinship groups, be these real or fictive – over others. The process of the ecclesiastical visitation and the handling of a conflict that troubled the inhabitants of an Indian parish represented an opportunity to affirm the authority of the Church as the dispenser of justice, even though no accord or definitive solution was arrived at. Along the way, the local social and political hierarchies that determined who spoke and what was said on behalf of the population were revealed and adapted. The inhabitants of the Andes encountered in the pastoral visitation a space that did not exist strictly for the purpose of silencing their voices; in it they learned and accepted the forms and channels of authority that the Church offered. Perhaps more important still: they did
whatever was within their grasp to employ these means to negotiate their own inclusion and visibility.

---


5 A useful synthesis of the precedents for pastoral visitations in canon law since the Middle Ages can be found in Bruno Léal, *La crosse et le bâton. Visites pastorales et recherche des pêcheurs publics dans la diocèse d’Algarve 1630-1750* (Paris: Centre Calouste Gulbenkian, 2004), p. 70.

6 The research on pastoral visitations in Spanish, Portuguese, Italian, and French dioceses takes account of this situation. The majority of authors agree that the decrees of Trent were crucial to promoting reform, although some historians who specialize in the ecclesiastical history of France have proposed that this country initiated and carried out its own Catholic Reformation, conforming to an internal process that preceded any response to the Council that took place in Italy. For an indication of the scope and frequency of pastoral visitations in France, see Gabriel Le Bras et al. *Répertoire des visites pastorales de la France* (Paris: Éditions du CNRS, 1977), 2 vols. Some examples of studies of specific visitations in the region of Italy include Cecilia Nubola, *Conoscere per governare: la diocesi di Trento nella visita pastorale di Ludovico Madruzzo* (159-1581) (Bologna: Mulino, 1993) and Diego Beggiao, *La visita pastorale di Clementi VIII (1592-1600): aspetti di reforma post-tridentina a Roma* (Roma: Libreria Editrice della Pontificia Università Lateranense, 1978). For the Spanish case, see María Milagros Cárcel Ortí, *Las visitas pastorales de España (siglos XVI-XX): propuesta de inventario y bibliografía*

7 Bireley, Redefining Catholicism, p.148. Given that the Catholic Reformation drove the creation of seminaries, Hayden and Greenshields assert that this had to do with a characteristic of modernization, since the "professionalization" of the clergy was an objective. Les réformations, p. 6.

8 Nubola, Conoscere per governare, p. 47.

9 In Trent, the inspector found many priests "negligent and confused, accustomed to using old rituals and formulas indiscriminately...without having any precise idea of their meaning." [my translation] Nubola, Ibid., 316, see also 324-29.

10 Bireley, Redefining Catholicism, p. 150.

11 With the creation of the Propaganda Fide (Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith) in the seventeenth century, the Church could boast an institution dedicated to the evangelization of peoples outside of Europe. The experience in Spanish America, though, had long preceded this, and must surely have enriched it.

12 Bireley, too, has made this observation with regard to Europe. Redefining Catholicism, p. 151.

13 Juan Guillermo Durán, El catecismo del III Concilio Provincial de Lima y sus complementos pastorales (1584-1585) (Buenos Aires: El Derecho, 1982), p. 67-68. In Portugal, the pious Sebastián I also granted the force of law to the decrees of Trent, for which he was congratulated by Pope Pius V who described him as "the first king in Christendom to give complete liberty to Church officials so that they can exercise the authority granted by the conciliar decrees. Léal, La crosse, p. 73 [my translation].

14 A pioneering study on the application of the decrees of the Council of Trent in America is that of Juan Villegas, Aplicación del Concilio de Trento en Hispanoamérica 1564-1600. Provincia eclesiástica del Perú. (Montevideo: Instituto Teológico del Uruguay, 1975). Villegas's study refers mainly to normative aspects. Other, subsequent studies that focus exclusively on the texts of the decrees, without necessarily incorporating the analysis of other documents or information from the archives, are Francesco Leonardo Lisi, El Tercer Concilio Limiento y la aculturación de los indígenas sudamericanos (Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 1990); Juan Guillermo Durán, Monumenta Catechetica Hispanoamericana (siglos XVI-XVIII) (Buenos Aires: Facultad de Teología de la Pontificia Universidad Católica Argentina “Santa María de los Buenos

In his introductory study of the work of Pablo Josep de Arriaga, Henrique Urbano underscores the importance of the institution of the pastoral visitation in ecclesiastical and secular spheres. Despite this broad consideration, its focus almost exclusively refers to the idolatry visitation. Pablo Joseph de Arriaga, La extirpación de la idolatría en el Pirú (1621). Preliminary study and notes by Henrique Urbano (Cuzco: Centro Bartolomé de las Casas, 1999), see pp. XL-XLVIII. In his study on the audiencia (a court of appeals and colonial administrative unit) of the archbishopric of Mexico, Jorge Traslosheiros presents an outlook solidly based on knowledge of the legal tradition of which the pastoral visitation formed a part. Traslosheiros, Iglesia, justicia y sociedad. An interesting examination of the legal activities of the Church is Ana de Zaballa’s study, “Del Viejo al Nuevo Mundo: novedades jurisdiccionales en los tribunales eclesiásticos en Nueva España”. In: Jorge Traslosheiros and Ana de Zaballa, coordinators, Los indios ante los foros de justicia religiosa en la Hispanoamérica virreinal (México D.F.: Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, 2010), pp. 17-46.

The questionnaires have been drawn from the documents in the Visitas Pastorales section of the archiepiscopal archive of Lima.


See in this regard the comments by Ana Sánchez in her study Amancebados, hechiceros y rebeldes (Cuzco: Centro de Estudios Regionales Andinos Bartolomé de las Casas, 1991), Introducción, pp. I-XLV.

I have discussed some of these topics in my study Death and Conversion in the Andes. Lima and Cuzco, 1532-1670. (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2010), especially p.160 and ff.

In his study of the Portuguese diocese of Algarve, Bruno Léal underscores the role of confession as one of three facets of the surveillance activity that the Church sought to exert upon society. The other two were the Inquisition and pastoral visitations. Léal, La crosse et le bâton, p. 79. For a classic study of confession, see Jean Delumeau, L’aveu et le pardon. Les difficultés de la confession, Xlle-XVille siècles (Paris: Fayard, 1990). On the problem of the conceptualization and translation of the concept of sin into a non-Christian medium, see Louise Burkhart, The Slippery Earth: Nahua-Christian Moral Dialogue in Sixteenth-Century Mexico (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1989). On confession in the context of evangelization in the Andes, see also Juan Carlos Estenssoro, Del paganismo a la santidad. La incorporación de los indios del Perú al catolicismo. (Lima: Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos, 2003), especially pp. 206-228.
Jeanne Ferté, written by the clergyman Lucas de Andrade in the seventeenth century, pp.228

Pastorales en la diócesis de Cartagena (Ed 28 Indians, see García Cabrera, ¿Idólatras congénitos...?, pp.104

Villagómez’s stance wp. 233. This is a sign of how distant the era of the conquest was. For an interpretation of women or if they have had them baptized for this purpose].” Edict in Lissón, hecho bautizar para este fin [what

22 For the case of the diocese of Trent, Nubola, Conoscere per governare, 323. The presence of itinerant preachers and missionaries belonging to religious orders must have been common in the Andes during the sixteenth century. As much is suggested by the convent chronicles such as, for example, those written by Fray Juan de Meléndez, Tesoros verdaderos de las Indias (Roma: Nicolas Angel Tiasco, 1681) or Fray Antonio de la Calancha, Corónica moralizada del orden de San Agustín (Lima: Ignacio Prado Pastor, 1974), about the Dominicans and the Augustinians, respectively. For example, in 1573, the caciques of the Pachacamac valley informed the Inspector Rodrigo Cantos de Andrade of the presence of a hermit whom they called ‘Paco Padre’ (Alpaca Father) for his brown clothing, and of this or that friar who had spent short spells among them evangelizing them. Maria Rostworowski, El señorío de Pachacamac: el informe de Rodrigo Cantos de Andrade de 1573 (Lima: Instituto de Estudios Peruanos, 1999), pp. 49-58.

23 Archivo Arzobispal de Lima (hereafter AAL), Visitas Pastorales, Leg. 11, exp. I, Visitas Pastorales, Leg. 13, exp. II, “Ynformacion fecha por via de visita a pedimiento de los caciques de la doctrina de Caujul de Andajes contra el padre fray Miguel Marques del horden de Nuestra Señora de las Mercedes [Report made by means of a visitation by petition of the caciques of the Indian parish of Caujul de Andajes against Father Fray Miguel Marques of the order of Our Lady of Mercy].” May 16, 1619; “Visita secreta de oficio contra el padre fray Juan Ramos Galban de la orden de predicadores cura de Allauca en los Yauyos, juez el licenciado Miguel Budi de Assorin” [Secret visitation ex officio against Father Fray Juan Ramos Galban of the Order of Preachers, pastor of Allauca in the Yauyos, the licentiate Miguel Budi de Assorin, judge], 3 April 1619.

24 These directives correspond to those set out for example in the Thirteenth Session of the Council of Trent, Decree on Reformation. Ignacio López de Ayala, El sacrosanto y ecuménico Concilio, 175-176.

25 Lobo Guerrero and Arias de Ugarte, Sínodos [1613], p.86. As for the Synod of 1636, it contains an additional article regarding the payments that the bishops’ envoys were required to make for the expenses incurred by their presence in the communities they visited.

26 AAL, Visitas Pastorales, Legajo 7, Expediente XX, Lima, 16 February 1642.

27 One concern that Villagómez’s questionnaire did not draw from the Edict of the Third Council is, “si algunas personas han tenido cópula carnal con mugeres infieles o las han hecho bautizar para este fin [whether any persons have had carnal relations with pagan women or if they have had them baptized for this purpose].” Edict in Lissón, La Iglesia, p. 233. This is a sign of how distant the era of the conquest was. For an interpretation of Villagómez’s stance with respect to the causes of and solution to idolatry among the Indians, see García Cabrera, ¿Idólatras congénitos...?, pp.104-107.

28 José Jesús García Hourcade and Antonio Irigoyen López, “Notas sobre las visitas pastorales en la diócesis de Cartagena (Edad Moderna), Contrastes. Revista de historia, n.12, 2001-2003, 263-284; Bruno Léal, La crosse et le bâton, especially the model edict written by the clergyman Lucas de Andrade in the seventeenth century, pp.228-230; Jeanne Ferté, La vie religieuse dans les campagnes parisiennes, 1622-1695 (Paris:
Libraire philosophique J. Vrin, 1962), especially the appendix of documents, pp. 375-396. Manuel Martín Riego, “La visita pastoral de las parroquias”. In: Memoria Ecclesiae XIV, pp. 168-170; María Milagros Cárcel Ortí, “Hacia un inventario de visitas pastorales en España de los siglos XVI-XX”. In: Memoria Ecclesiae XIV (Oviedo: Asociación de Archiveros de la Iglesia en España, 1999). The author also offers an extensive list of the documentation and historiography concerning this theme for other European countries.  

Manuel Martín Riego, La visita pastoral, p. 169. Midwives aroused the concern of the Church, with good reason. Not only the lives, but also in many cases the spiritual well-being of newborns depended on them. In Europe midwives were expected to baptize children in cases of necessity. In France, the midwife had to swear an oath before the bishop and was examined for her spiritual competence. Many parishes lacked midwives and some of them refused to take the oath or did not appear before the bishop when he visited the parish. Ferté, La vie religieuse, p. 295. The pastoral visitations to the Limaño dioceses do not contain information about health specialists and offer little or no information about hospitals in the Indian parishes. Regarding these last, see Gabriela Ramos, Death and Conversion, pp. 99-109; Gabriela Ramos, ‘Indian Hospitals and Government in the Colonial Andes’, Medical History, (2013), 57, n. 2, pp. 186-205, doi:10.1017/mdh.2012.102.  

La vida religiosa de los indios anteriores a sus conversiones. In: Libro de la fe y la costumbres. Catálogo de lIglesia en España, (Séville: La Libraire philosophique J. Vrin, 1962), especially the appendix of documents, pp. 375-396. Manuel Martín Riego, “La visita pastoral de las parroquias”. In: Memoria Ecclesiae XIV, pp. 168-170; María Milagros Cárcel Ortí, “Hacia un inventario de visitas pastorales en España de los siglos XVI-XX”. In: Memoria Ecclesiae XIV (Oviedo: Asociación de Archiveros de la Iglesia en España, 1999). The author also offers an extensive list of the documentation and historiography concerning this theme for other European countries.  

Manuel Martín Riego, La visita pastoral, p. 169. Midwives aroused the concern of the Church, with good reason. Not only the lives, but also in many cases the spiritual well-being of newborns depended on them. In Europe midwives were expected to baptize children in cases of necessity. In France, the midwife had to swear an oath before the bishop and was examined for her spiritual competence. Many parishes lacked midwives and some of them refused to take the oath or did not appear before the bishop when he visited the parish. Ferté, La vie religieuse, p. 295-298. The pastoral visitations to the Limaño dioceses do not contain information about health specialists and offer little or no information about hospitals in the Indian parishes. Regarding these last, see Gabriela Ramos, Death and Conversion, pp. 99-109; Gabriela Ramos, ‘Indian Hospitals and Government in the Colonial Andes’, Medical History, (2013), 57, n. 2, pp. 186-205, doi:10.1017/mdh.2012.102.  

Midwives aroused the concern of the Church, with good reason. Not only the lives, but also in many cases the spiritual well-being of newborns depended on them. In Europe midwives were expected to baptize children in cases of necessity. In France, the midwife had to swear an oath before the bishop and was examined for her spiritual competence. Many parishes lacked midwives and some of them refused to take the oath or did not appear before the bishop when he visited the parish. Ferté, La vie religieuse, p. 295-298. The pastoral visitations to the Limaño dioceses do not contain information about health specialists and offer little or no information about hospitals in the Indian parishes. Regarding these last, see Gabriela Ramos, Death and Conversion, pp. 99-109; Gabriela Ramos, ‘Indian Hospitals and Government in the Colonial Andes’, Medical History, (2013), 57, n. 2, pp. 186-205, doi:10.1017/mdh.2012.102.  


In a study which compares the attitudes toward idolatry of two of the principal proponents of its uprooting in the seventeenth century, the Jesuit José de Arriaga and the Archbishop of Lima Pedro de Villagómez, Juan Carlos García explains that Arriaga sought to bring about a reform of pastoral visitations within the Lima diocese. This would be achieved by means of combining ordinary visitations with the missions in the care of the Jesuit fathers. These last would be entrusted with the instruction and confession of the Andean parishioners, while the diocesan representative would administer justice. The pastoral visitations, for their part, would be charged with overseeing the good conduct of the priests of the Indian parishes so that the missions would bear fruit. Juan Carlos García Cabrera, “¿Idólatras congénitos o indios sin doctrina? Dos comprensiones divergentes sobre la idolatría andina en el siglo XVII”. In: Jorge Traslosberos and Ana de Zaballa, coordinators, Los indios ante los foros de justicia, 95-110. On the Jesuit missions in Peru, see Aliocha Maldavsky, Vocaciones inciertas. Misión y misioneros en la provincia jesuita del Perú en los siglos XVI y XVII (Seville: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos, Universidad Antonio Ruiz de Montoya, 2012).

Lobo Guerrero and Arias de Ugarte, Sinodos de Lima, p. 76.

In his study of missions in Europe during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, Châtelier presents an astute analysis of the ritual of these visitations. La religion, pp. 61-86.

Examples of situations that provoked parishioners' complaints are listed and described briefly in Melecio Tineo, La fe y la costumbres. Catálogo de la sección
The subject has been studied by, for example, Yanna Yannakis in *The Art of Being in Between: Native Intermediaries, Indian Identity, and Local Rule in Colonial Oaxaca* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2008). See also Lori Boornazian Diel, *The Tira de Tepechpan: Negotiating Place under Aztec and Spanish Rule* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2008).

36 AAL, *Visitaciones pastorales*, leg. 9, expediente 16, Visit to the church of San Joseph del Chorrillo, May 1648


38 “Camachic, camachicuc. Gouvernior, o corregidor, o mandon, o el que manda, o el que rige”. [Camachic, camachicuc. Governor, or magistrate, or boss, or he who orders]

39 AAL, *Visitaciones pastorales*, leg. 9, expediente 16, f. 4v-5.

40 In his study of church legislation in sixteenth-century Peru, Valentín Trujillo Mena asserted that only parish churches were entitled to have the Eucharist on display. However, the example discussed in this article suggests that such exclusivity could be contested. Valentín Trujillo Mena, *La legislación eclesiástica en el virreinato del Perú durante el siglo XVI. Con especial dedicación a la jerarquía y a la organización diocesana* (Lima: Lumen, 1981), pp. 244-245.

41 The deeds of their ancestral heroes are among the few put into writing that have come down to us. See Gerald Taylor, *Ritos y tradiciones de Huarochirí* (Lima: Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos, Banco Central de Reserva del Perú, Universidad Particular Ricardo Palma, 1999). The most complete study on Huarochirí under colonial rule is that of Karen Spalding, *Huarochirí: An Andean Society Under Inca and Spanish Rule* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1984).


46 I have not consulted the *Retasa* (re-assessment of population and headtax) of 1577, one of the documents that Rostworowski used to study the ethnohistory of the province.
of Huarochirí. Rostworowski, however, maintains that one cannot reach definitive conclusions about the manner in which the reductions were made. Rostworowski, Señoríos indígenas, 112. Citing this same document, Rostworowski maintains that the name of the principal Indian parish that concerns us was San José de Chorrillos de Aquipa, but apart from that, I have not found any similar reference. Rostworowski, Señoríos indígenas, 114.


48 AAL, Visitas Pastorales, leg. 9, exp. 16, f. 5.

49 Statement of Juan Bautista, in AAL, Visitas pastorales, leg. 9, exp. 16, f. 11. Statement of Don Juan Chauca Guaman, Ibid, f. 30v.

50 Ibid, f. 25.


52 “…dijo que no ha visto en todo el tiempo que ha sido cura en esta doctrina el dicho licenciado Martín de Mena que en alguna iglesia de todos los pueblos de ella haya Santísimo Sacramento que es el cuerpo de Nuestro Señor Jesucristo y tiene por cierto que los indios naturales de estos pueblos recibieran gran consuelo y edificación si le tuvieran el tiempo que el dicho su cura asiste en alguno de ellos y sabe que en este pueblo y en el de Santo Domingo de los Olleros se pide limosna con insignia del Santísimo para su cera la cual dieran todos los naturales con muy buena voluntad si le tuviere el dicho su cura como dicho es en el dicho sagrario…”. Ibid, f. 10. [He says that he has not seen in all the time that the said licentiate Martín de Mena has been pastor in this parish that the Most Holy Sacrament which is the body of Our Lord Jesus Christ was [present] in any church in all the towns of [the parish]; and he is certain that the Indians of these towns would receive great consolation and edification if they were to have it [during] the time the said priest was attending [to his duties] in any of them and he knows that in this town and in that of Santo Domingo de los Olleros alms are solicited with the insignia of the Most Holy for its wax, which all the Indians would give with good will if their said pastor were to have [the Sacrament] in the said tabernacle.]

53 Ibid, f. 7v-8.

54 Mena Godoy added “because their said town is not stable and they poor they do not have the capacity to keep the Most Blessed Sacrament with the decency that it is due. “…porque no es estable la dicha población de ellos y ser pobres no tienen comodidad para poder tener el Santísimo Sacramento con la decencia que se debe...”. Ibid, f. 46.

55 One must admit that the same Dávila Briceño recognized after having left the post of corregidor (royal district magistrate) that he had proceeded to implement the reductions with the understanding that although there was not enough land for all, the settlers would be permitted to return temporarily to their old towns. This was
explained in the *juicio de residencia* (judicial review of office) given by his successor, Cristóbal Juárez de Angulo. The passage in which he explains this has been cited by Rostworowski, *Señoríos*, p. 110-111. Regarding the problem of land access for the inhabitants of the reductions, see Mumford, *Vertical Empire*, pp. 144-145. The author maintains that the reductions were largely a failure.

56 Gabriel Ramón Joffré, “Producción alfarera en Santo Domingo de los Olleros (Huarochirí – Lima)”. *Boletín del Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos*, 1999, 28 (2), 215-248. See pp. 220-221. The author suggests that this could have been a Spanish town founded on an indigenous site. The data from this pastoral visitation does not support this hypothesis.

57 Testimony of Don Diego Canchu Ñaupa, from the town of San Pedro de Matara, *cacique* [headman] of the Lacacica kin group [ayllo], AAL, *Visitas Pastorales*, leg. 9, exp. 16, f. 16v.